

# A COMPARATIVE STUDY BETWEEN READING ALOUD AND SILENT READING TOWARDS STUDENTS' READING COMPREHENSION

### Niro Arif SAS<sup>1</sup>, Amirah Widia Adiarti<sup>2</sup>

### <sup>1,2</sup>Universitas Islam An Nur Lampung

#### Email: niroarif10@gmail.com

#### Abstract

In teaching and learning process, many students found difficulties in learning English. One of the difficulties was their lack of reading comprehension. Furthermore, the students have problem in reading comprehension to transfer information from the text and students' motivation in reading text is still low. In addition the technique that was used by the teacher to teach students was monotonous, that it made students felt bored to join the English lesson. It was supported by the students' reading score, that 74.42 % of students got < 70score. For that reason, approaches are important to support success in teaching learning process to improve the students' reading comprehension. The approaches are reading aloud and silent reading. Based on the opinion, the objective of this research is to find out whether there is a significant difference in students' reading comprehension between those who are taught through reading aloud and those who are taught through silent reading. In this research, the researcher used causal comparative study method where there was one step in collecting the data; it was post test. The population of this research was the eighth grade of MTs PEMNU Talangpadang Tanggamus and the sample as chosen by doing cluster random sampling. Two classes were chosen as experimental class and control class. Experimental class was given treatment by using reading aloud and control class was given treatment by using silent reading. The researcher conducted five meetings in each class during the research, including four treatments and one post-test that was given to the students at the last meeting. The result of this research showing that there is a significant different of students' reading comprehension between those who are taught through reading aloud and those who are taught through silent reading at the eighth grade of MTs PEMNU Talangpadang Tanggamus. It is proved by the result of statistical calculation using t-test formula. It is obtained that T-observed was 3.55, while the critical value of Tcritical at degree of significance 5% and df = 54 was 2.00. Because T-observed is higher than T-critical value, it means the use of reading aloud and silent reading had significant difference in students' reading comprehension.

Keywords: Reading Aloud, Silent Reading, Reading Comprehension

### **INTRODUCTION**

Language is very important to communicate in society. Language is made up of sounds, words and sentence. Brown states, "Language is more than a system or communication. It involves whole person, culture, educational, developmental communicative process"[1]. It means language is measured as a means of communication and it is difficult to do all activities without language.

English as the international language is needed and very important in the world because English is used as a tool for international communication. It plays an important role in many aspects of life such as education, economic, technology and international relationship. In some countries, English becomes second language, but in Indonesia English becomes foreign language. It is the first foreign language and must be taught in every school from kindergarten up to university. English is taught



Nusantara Hasana Journal Volume 4 No. 12 (Mei 2025), Page: 247-253

E-ISSN : 2798-1428

for kindergarten as introduction about the first foreign language in Indonesia, and for elementary school as the local content subject, whereas from junior high school up to university as the compulsory subject.

Harmer says, "English as a foreign language is generally taken to apply the students who one studying general English at the schools and institutes in their own country or as transitory visitors as a target language country"[2]. It means that the purpose of teaching English as the first foreign language is to create a situation that the students can use English as a means of communication. The students should be put into situation that they can use English for communication both oral and written.

English is a subject matter in school that covers the four basic language skills: listening, speaking, reading and writing. In every subject, students learn activities involving reading. That is why reading is very essential for students because by reading, the students will get much information and knowledge in their everyday life. It is due to the fact that students read for their everyday need like reading books, newspapers, labels, notices, and schedules. Reading is an active process which consists of recognition and comprehension skill [3]. It means that reading is a process which done by the reader get the information from printed text and then by reading also the reader can understand the writer means.

Reading can be defined in many ways; it depends on the one who will give the definition, reading is the construction of meaning from a printed or written message. The construction of meaning involves the reader connecting information from the written message with previous knowledge to arrive at meaning at an understanding [4]. It means that reading is interpret of the meaning and understanding information involves the students read from the text.

According to Gene, reading is a complex process made up of several interlocking skills and processes [5]. It means that reading is a process involving many factors, including the internal and external factors, which factors to support the reading comprehension.

However, Reading is a complex process which involves not only the readers' ability to read text but also their experience to comprehend it. It happened to the students at the eighth grade of MTs PEMNU Talangpadang Tanggamus. Based on the preliminary research, the researcher found some problems faced by the students at the eighth grade of MTs PEMNU Talangpadang. There are various factors that might have been the cause of the failure in reading teaching. By interviewing Pertia Ningsih, S.Pd as an English teacher who is teaching there, the researcher found that the students have problem in reading comprehension to transfer information from the text and students' motivation in reading text is still low. The teacher got the score based on the formative test of reading once she administered, it was found that many of them still lack of reading comprehension. Furthermore, she said that score of KKM (criteria of minimum mastery) in MTs PEMNU is 70.

Teaching approach is very helpful both for teacher and students in the teaching and learning process. By applying an appropriate and interesting method, it will make teaching and learning process run well and the goal of teaching and learning will be easier achieved. If the teacher does not use an interesting method, the teaching and learning process will be boring. This situation appeared at the eighth grade students of the MTs PEMNU Talangpadang Tanggamus. According to the students, the teacher did not have an interesting method to teach reading.



Nusantara Hasana Journal Volume 4 No. 12 (Mei 2025), Page: 247-253 E-ISSN : 2798-1428

They said that the teacher seldom uses a variety of method in giving material, she only uses monotonous method in every meetings. So that they felt so difficult to learn and also they lost motivation in learn it, as a result, they do not have knowledge of English language skills such as reading.

From those problems, the researcher concludes that the students' reading comprehension at the eighth grade of MTs PEMNU Talangpadang Tanggamus is still low and need to be improved. It happened because the students have some problems in reading comprehension to transfer information from the text, students' motivation in reading is still low, and the teacher did not have an interesting approach in teaching reading.

As an English teacher, she should have some approaches that can interest the students in learning, so it can make teaching learning process run well. Because, an approach is a set of correlative assumptions dealing with the nature of language teaching and learning. An approach is axiomatic. It describes the nature of the subject matter to be taught. To solve these problems the teacher can apply some approaches in order to make the students enjoy and will be pay attention when teaching learning process. Two of the effective approaches that can be used by the teacher are by using reading aloud and silent reading.

Reading aloud is an activity which is a tool for teachers, students, or the reader together with another person or listener to capture and understand information, thoughts, and feelings of an author [6]. It means that reading aloud is an activity or tool for teachers, students or the reader to understand information, thoughts, and feelings of an author. Reading aloud plays important role in teaching of English, because reading aloud enables learner to develop the skill of reading very well by speaking or expressing ideas, makes reading very enjoyable, improves listening skills, enriches vocabulary, improves reading comprehension, and no less important is the growing interest in reading to students.

On the other hand, silent reading is reading by using visual memory, involves the activation of the eyes and memories. The main objective silent reading is to obtain information. It means that in silent reading, we just use visual memory, involving the activation of the eyes and memories. Silent reading is a very important in teaching English. This reading should be employed to increase reading comprehension among learners. Silent reading is done to acquire a lot of information. Teacher has to make them read silently as and when they are able to read without any difficulties. It is kind of habit in which learner are enabled to read without any audible whisper. It means that silent reading is so important in teaching of English especially in teaching reading, because this activity can increase the student's reading comprehension, and the students can easy understand to get a lot of information from the text.

Based on those theories can be concluded that reading aloud and silent reading are an activity which is a tool for the teachers and students. But, both of them are different. Reading aloud is saying a written text aloud. This can be done with or without understanding its content but silent reading is reading text without voice and just use visual memory and usually used in order to understand the result of reading that is done.

### METHOD



Nusantara Hasana Journal Volume 4 No. 12 (Mei 2025), Page: 247-253

Volume 4 No. 12 (Mei 2025), Page: 24 E-ISSN : 2798-1428

In this research, the researcher used causal comparative study method. An experiment is a process or one step that to be done systematically and performatically in order to get problem solving or to get answer to certain question. So in this research, there were two groups and both of them received the treatment. The post-test was conducted to know the students' reading comprehension after the treatment. There were two groups of students of this research, experimental class and control class [7]. The researcher gave the test to both classes with the same material but different approach in order to find the differences in achievement between the students who were taught through reading aloud and silent reading. The subjects of this study were eight grade students of MTs PEMNU Talang Padang Tanggamus. The researcher took two classes as sample: VIII B as experimental class.

In this research, the researcher collected the data from the test, that was posttest. It was done to know the students' reading comprehension after they were taught using reading aloud and silent reading. The post-test was used to measure the students' reading comprehension in their reading in order to know the development of the students' reading comprehension after reading aloud and silent reading was applied.

Furthermore, the data were analyzed through some ways: (1) planning: determining the sample, preparing try-out and analyzing the data that was received from try-out, determining the material to be tught, preparing the psot-test. (2) Application : in the first meeting, the researcher gave try-out to the class that is not chosen, in the second, third, fourth and fifth meeting the researcher conducted the treatment in experiment class and control class, in the last meeting, the researcher gave post-test. (3) reporting: analyzing the data that is received from post test, making a report of the findings.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

The object of this research was the eighth grade students of MTs PEMNU Talangpadang Tanggamus. There were three classes of the eighth grade and two classes were taken as the sample. The first class was as the experimental class and the second class was as the control class. The classes were chosen randomly, class VIII B was as the experimental class and class VIII A was as the control class. Each class there was 28 students. Try out test was given in order to see the reliability and validity. The post-test were given both in control class and in experimental class in order to see whether there is significant difference of students' reading comprehension between the students those who are taught through reading aloud and the students those who are taught through silent reading.

### The Result of Post-test

The analysis showed that the mean score of post-test in experimental class the mean score was 70.35 the highest score was 100 and the lowest was 44. The median score was 69.5 and the mode score was 72 in which there were 7 students. While in control class the mean score was 56.03 the highest score was 89 and the lowest was 28 the median score was 58 and the mode score was 72 in which there were 6 students.

### The Result of Normality Test

The score of normality test of post-test of both experimental and control class



Nusantara Hasana Journal Volume 4 No. 12 (Mei 2025), Page: 247-253

E-ISSN : 2798-1428

were marked by L observed, from the data gained, the Lo of each datum are as follows: L observed post-test of experimental class was 0.156, L observed post-test of control class was 0.120. The results above were to be consulted to *liliefors* table. For 28 students, the score of L critical was 0.161. Finally, if L observed was  $\leq$  L critical. The researcher concluded that the data in both classes were normality distributed.

# The Result of Homogeneity Test

From the data gained, the homogeneity test of experimental class and control class were 1. 19 the result above was to be consulted to *fisher* table, it was found that F critical of

0.05 (28-1,28-1) = 1.88. The data came from homogenous data provided Fh < Ft. Finally it could be concluded that the data came from homogenous data.

## The Result of Hypothetical Test

At the end data analysis, the hypothesis was tested to prove the hypothesis whether the proposed hypothesis was accepted or rejected. To test the hypothesis, T-test formula was used. The result of computation of T-test was called T-ratio. The criterion for accepting the hypothesis test was if T observed was higher than T critical at certain level of significant. The criterion for rejecting the hypothesis test was if T observed was lowering than T critical at certain level of significant.

Based on the result of the research, it can be seen that the result of teaching reading comprehension those who taught through reading aloud gave better or higher result than those who taught through silent reading.

Most students both in the experimental and control class gave response to what teacher instructed. All of students in the experimental class and control class gave good response. They tried to do those activities well. They were enthusiastic in teaching learning process. The researcher asked to the students both in the experimental class and control class, they said that they enjoyed learning reading through reading aloud and silent reading. They helped students to identify and understanding the text.

After getting the treatments and post-test was conducted, it found that there was significant differences between the experimental class and control class those who are taught through reading aloud and those who are taught through silent reading. Where the result of teaching reading comprehension those who are taught through reading aloud was higher than those who are taught through silent reading. It could be seen the mean post-test score of experimental class was 70.357 and in the post-test score of control class was 56.035.

Based on the analysis of the data and the testing of hypothesis, the result of the calculation was found that the null hypothesis (Ho) was rejected and the alternative hypothesis (Ha) was accepted. In the test, the average score of the test of the students. From the analysis above, we know that the students who got high frequency of reading aloud got better result than silent reading. So, in this case, the researcher would like to say reading aloud was one of good approach in motivating students learning English, especially in reading comprehension. It can be said that reading aloud can improve students' reading comprehension.

There were differences the students' atmosphere that was taught using reading aloud and that was taught using silent reading. It could be seen in teaching learning process, they were as follows:



Nusantara Hasana Journal Volume 4 No. 12 (Mei 2025), Page: 247-253 E-ISSN : 2798-1428

# 1. In the experimental class

When the researcher taught using reading aloud, it made the students more interested and active in learning. In the teaching and learning process the students felt more enjoy and relax, but the class was so crowded, so they could freely express their idea in the classroom. When the researcher gave them assignment, the students did it fun.

2. In the control class

When the researcher taught by using silent reading, it made the students more interested and gave good response. When the teaching learning process, the class too silent and without sound. It made the researcher difficulty to know the student read the text or no. When the researcher gave them assignment, the students did it fun.

Based on the statement above, the result of data analysis showed that the result of T-test is 3.55 and the result of  $t_{critical}$  is 2.00, because the  $t_{observed} > t_{critical}$ , it meant that there was a significant different achievement between the students those who are taught through reading aloud and those who are taught through silent reading towards students' reading comprehension.

## CONCLUSION

In the previous chapter the researcher has analyzed the data statistically. Based on the statistical analysis, it can be concluded there is improvement of students' reading comprehension between the post-test score of experiment class. On the other hand, there is no improvement of students' reading comprehension between the students' post-test score of control class. The mean of post-test in experimental class was statistically higher than that of the post-test in control class. The researcher concluded there is difference of students' reading comprehension between those who are taught through reading aloud and those who are taught through silent reading at the second semester of the eighth grade of MTs PEMNU Talangpadang Tanggamus. It is supported by T observed > T critical that is 3.55 > 2.00. It means that there is advantage of using reading aloud and silent reading towards students' reading comprehension.

## REFERENCES

- 1. Brown, H Douglas. (1998). *Teaching by principles, An interactive Approach to Language Pedagogy*. Sanfransisco State Universiy: Longman.
- 2. Harmer, Jeremy. (1991). *The Practice of English Language Teaching*. Singapore: Longman Group UK Limited.
- 3. Patel, M. F and Praveen M. Jain. (2008). *English Language Teaching*. Jaipur: Sunrice.
- 4. Day, Richard R and Julian Bamford. (2008). *Extensive Reading in the Second Language Classroom*. Cambridge Language Education: Longman.
- 5. Gene R. Carter. (2003). *The Threads of Reading Strategies For Literacy Development*. (Virginia USA: Alexandria.
- 6. Tarigan. (1985). *Membaca Sebagai Suatu Keterampilan Berbahasa*. Bandung: Angkasa.



7. Setiyadi, Bambang.(2006). *Metode Penelitian Untuk Pengajaran Bahasa Asing Pendekatan Kuantitatif dan Kualitatif*. Yogyakarta: Graha Ilmu.